NEGATIVE: H-1B Visas

By "Coach Vance" Trefethen

***Resolved: The United States federal government should substantially reduce its restrictions on legal immigration to the United States.***

H-1B visas are visas given to hi-tech foreigners to work for 3 years in the U.S. (and can be renewed once for 3 more years). There's no shortage of US workers in hi-tech fields, instead there's a shortage of jobs. When Americans are fired and have to train the H-1s during their last weeks on the job, no one can say Americans lack the skills to do the job. H-1B immigrants replace US workers and drive down wages for those who are lucky enough to keep their jobs. And they drain talent and hardworking people away from poor countries like India, where they could be building up their economy and uplifting their own people.

NEGATIVE: H-1B Visas 3

INHERENCY 3

1. No shortage of workers 3

No Shortage of US hi-tech workers. There's a shortage of JOBS, not workers 3

Big surplus of US hi-tech graduates, who aren't finding jobs 3

"Shortage" argument is a red herring – employers can't show one 3

No shortage of tech workers: The US has more than enough workers and new graduates have trouble getting jobs 4

No "talent shortage" – just a lie to justify cheap labor 4

Surplus of Americans with computer PhDs – and they can't get work because we're bringing in so many H-1Bs 4

2. Other solutions to Doctor shortage exist 5

Increased doctor supply alone won't solve, but other solutions are coming 5

Status Quo reforms will solve the apparent doctor shortage 5

SOLVENCY 6

1. Not the best & brightest – no massive benefit to the U.S. 6

H-1B workers are average or below average, and no one's ever proven that they're better than Americans 6

DISADVANTAGES 6

1. American workers displaced 6

More and more companies use H-1B to fire US workers & replace them with immigrants 6

The top 10 H-1B hiring firms are outsourcing companies specifically designed to replace American workers 7

Despite the wording of the law, the Dept of Labor says employers can legally cut wages and legally replace existing US workers with H-1Bs 7

H-1B is all about shipping US jobs to India 7

A/T "H-1B reduces outsourcing by bringing workers here" - Step by step process of how H-1B speeds up outsourcing of US jobs 8

A/T "They have to hire Americans first" - Loophole in the H-1B law says: No they don't, if the job pays more than $60K 8

2. American workers' pay reduced 8

1) H-1B employers use loopholes to pay less. 2) Simple supply & demand: When you bring in more workers, you drive down wages for everyone 8

Loopholes allow H-1B employers to pay lower wages 9

3. Foreign workers exploited 9

H-1B exploits workers because they have no other options and can't complain about wages or work conditions 9

H-1B's are indentured servants, and that's one of the attractive features why companies want them. They can't switch to another employer 9

4. "Brain Drain" hurts poor countries sending immigrants to the US 10

Poor in India lose health care when their doctors immigrate to the US with H-1B 10

Talented workers should be encouraged to stay home and build up their own countries instead of migrating to the U.S. 10

5. "Best & Brightest" Turn 10

Link & Impact: Actually they're NOT the best & brightest, and their lack of skills drags down the US economy 10

Works Cited: H-1B Visas - con 11

NEGATIVE: H-1B Visas

INHERENCY

1. No shortage of workers

No Shortage of US hi-tech workers. There's a shortage of JOBS, not workers

WALL STREET JOURNAL 2016 (journalists Jon Hilsenrath and Bob Davis) America’s Dazzling Tech Boom Has a Downside: Not Enough Jobs <https://www.wsj.com/articles/americas-dazzling-tech-boom-has-a-downside-not-enough-jobs-1476282355?mod=djemalertNEWS>

The technology revolution has delivered Google searches, Facebook friends, iPhone apps, [Twitter](http://quotes.wsj.com/TWTR) rants and shopping for almost anything on Amazon, all in the past decade and a half. What it hasn’t delivered are many jobs. Google’s [Alphabet](http://quotes.wsj.com/GOOGL) Inc. and [Facebook](http://quotes.wsj.com/FB) Inc. had at the end of last year a total of 74,505 employees, about one-third fewer than [Microsoft](http://quotes.wsj.com/MSFT) Corp. even though their combined stock-market value is twice as big. Photo-sharing service Instagram had 13 employees when it was acquired [for $1 billion](http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052702303815404577333840377381670) by Facebook in 2012. Hiring in the computer and chip sectors dove after companies shifted hardware production outside the U.S., and the newest tech giants needed relatively few workers. The number of [technology startups](http://www.wsj.com/news/topic/3961) fizzled. [Growth in productivity](http://www.wsj.com/articles/u-s-productivity-fell-1-in-first-quarter-1462365346) and wages slowed, and [income inequality rose](http://blogs.wsj.com/economics/2016/09/13/u-s-poverty-and-income-inequality-in-9-charts/) as machines replaced routine, low- and middle-income, human-powered work.   
Technology Booms, But Not For American Workers  
After rising in the 1990s, employment at computer and electronic firms has fallen by more than 40%, though a smaller number of jobs has been created in other tech sectors.

Big surplus of US hi-tech graduates, who aren't finding jobs

Harvard Business Review 2017 (Nicole Torres, assistant editor) 4 May 2017 The H-1B Visa Debate, Explained <https://hbr.org/2017/05/the-h-1b-visa-debate-explained> (brackets added)

An [analysis led by Hal Salzman](http://www.epi.org/publication/bp359-guestworkers-high-skill-labor-market-analysis/), a professor at Rutgers University, found that the U.S. graduates more STEM [science, technology, engineering & math] workers than the tech industry needs and that STEM wages have stayed depressingly flat. They write:  
For every two students that U.S. colleges graduate with STEM degrees, only one is hired into a STEM job. In computer and information science and in engineering, U.S. colleges graduate 50 percent more students than are hired into those fields each year; of the computer science graduates not entering the IT workforce, 32 percent say it is because IT jobs are unavailable, and 53 percent say they found better job opportunities outside of IT occupations.

"Shortage" argument is a red herring – employers can't show one

Harvard Business Review 2017 (Nicole Torres, assistant editor) 4 May 2017 The H-1B Visa Debate, Explained <https://hbr.org/2017/05/the-h-1b-visa-debate-explained> (brackets added)

According to [professor of public policy at Howard University, Ronil] Hira, the skills shortage argument is a red herring that has clouded the conversation about how H-1Bs are used. “The top occupation of H-1B workers is computer systems analyst. These are back-end IT workers. I don’t see how anybody could argue there’s a shortage of those folks,” he says. “Hiring an H-1B should, but doesn’t, require an employer to demonstrate any shortage, so the shortage argument is moot. If there is a severe shortage, then it would be easy for employers to show one. Yet they’ve opposed any such requirement.”

No shortage of tech workers: The US has more than enough workers and new graduates have trouble getting jobs

Dr. Hal Salzman, Daniel Kuehn and Dr. B. Lindsay Lowell 2013 (Salzman is Professor at the John J. Heldrich Center for Workforce Development and the Edward J. Bloustein School of Planning and Public Policy at Rutgers University.; PhD in sociology from Brandeis Univ Kuehn is a doctoral candidate in American University’s Department of Economics. Lowell is Director of Policy Studies at the Institute for the Study of International Migration, Georgetown University., PhD in demography from Brown Univ.) 24 Apr 2013 Guestworkers in the high-skill U.S. labor market <https://www.epi.org/publication/bp359-guestworkers-high-skill-labor-market-analysis/>

Our examination of the IT labor market, guestworker flows, and the STEM education pipeline finds consistent and clear trends suggesting that *the United States has more than a sufficient supply of workers available to work in STEM occupations:* The flow of U.S. students (citizens and permanent residents) into STEM fields has been strong over the past decade, and the number of U.S. graduates with STEM majors appears to be responsive to changes in employment levels and wages. For every two students that U.S. colleges graduate with STEM degrees, only one is hired into a STEM job. In computer and information science and in engineering, U.S. colleges graduate 50 percent more students than are hired into those fields each year; of the computer science graduates not entering the IT workforce, 32 percent say it is because IT jobs are unavailable, and 53 percent say they found better job opportunities outside of IT occupations. These responses suggest that the supply of graduates is substantially larger than the demand for them in industry.

No "talent shortage" – just a lie to justify cheap labor

Prof. Norm Matloff 2017 (computer science, Univ of California-Davis) 3 Feb 2017 " Trump Is Right: Silicon Valley Is Using H-1B Visas To Pay Low Wages To Immigrants" HUFFINGTON POST <https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/trump-h-1b_us_5890d86ce4b0522c7d3d84af>

The order aims to overhaul and limit work visas, notably the H-1B visa program. Tech companies rely on these to bring in foreign talent. Their lobbyists claim there is a “talent shortage” among Americans and thus that the industry needs more of such work visas. This is patently false. The truth is that they want an expansion of the H-1B work visa program because they want to hire cheap, immobile labor — i.e., foreign workers.

Surplus of Americans with computer PhDs – and they can't get work because we're bringing in so many H-1Bs

Prof. Norm Matloff 2017 (computer science, Univ of California-Davis) 3 Feb 2017 " Trump Is Right: Silicon Valley Is Using H-1B Visas To Pay Low Wages To Immigrants" HUFFINGTON POST <https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/trump-h-1b_us_5890d86ce4b0522c7d3d84af>

The industry especially asserts a need to hire H-1Bs with a PhD, citing the fact that 50 percent of computer science doctorates in the U.S. are granted to foreign students. What they are hiding in that claim is that it simply doesn’t pay for an American student (i.e. U.S. citizen or permanent resident) to pursue doctoral study, as the salary premium for a doctorate is too small. That small wage premium is due to the flooding of the market by foreign applicants, something correctly [forecast (with approbation)](http://users.nber.org/~peat/PapersFolder/Papers/SG/NSF.htm) by the National Science Foundation years ago. The industry claim is doubly deceptive, as they are not very keen to hire PhDs because this level of study just isn’t needed. We actually have a surplus of computer science PhDs; 11.3 percent of them are [involuntarily working in a non-computer science field](http://ncsesdata.nsf.gov/doctoratework/2013/html/SDR2013_DST32_2.html).

2. Other solutions to Doctor shortage exist

Increased doctor supply alone won't solve, but other solutions are coming

Carnahan Group Strategic Healthcare Advisors 2017 ( a strategic healthcare firm in **Tampa, FL** and **Nashville, TN** that has consulted with the world’s largest for-profit and non-profit health organizations in the areas of community needs assessments, valuations, transactions, and strategic planning ) 17 July 2017  INTRODUCTION: IS THERE A PHYSICIAN SHORTAGE IN THE U.S.? <http://carnahangroup.com/industry-news/maldistribution-physicians-united-states/>

Increasing the number of physicians alone is not likely to resolve potential scarcities. Fewer physicians are choosing primary care as their occupation (opting for specialty) or practicing in rural/undeserved areas. There are several solutions for the healthcare field that involve improving overall analytic capabilities. Possible solutions include, new care-delivery and financing models, telemedicine and digital technology, and analyzing the physician workforce and productivity. Introducing new-care delivery and financing models that include patient-centered medical homes, shared savings programs, and integrated delivery systems can help improve the coordination and quality of patient care as well as assist in the implementation of best practices. Provisions in the ACA promote the increased use of new-care delivery models (Accountable Care Organizations or ACOs). Telemedicine and digital technology can be introduced as another potential solution, but it is important for healthcare entities to analyze the implications of implementing these tools. The adoption of technology has been proven to reduce the demand for physicians. Adoption of health IT by just 1/3 of the community-based physicians has resulted in a decreased demand from 4% to 9%.Healthcare facilities should investigate how telemedicine and digital technology can improve patient access, patient-care utilization outcomes, and physician productivity in their market.Historically, technological advances have made providers more productive and have increased the amount of opportunities for patients to be treated. Understanding and analyzing physician workforce/productivity in new care-delivery models and in the adoption of IT innovations is beneficial to healthcare organizations as well.

Status Quo reforms will solve the apparent doctor shortage

Dr Paul Keckley 2018 (PhD; **Independent Healthcare Research and Policy Analysis; former** Managing Director of the Navigant Center for Healthcare Research and Policy Analysis) 12 Mar 2018 "[MYTH: THERE'S A PHYSICIAN SHORTAGE IN THE U.S.](http://www.paulkeckley.com/report/2018/3/12/myth-theres-a-physician-shortage-in-the-us)" <http://www.paulkeckley.com/report/2018/3/12/myth-theres-a-physician-shortage-in-the-us>

The bottom line: the public policies impacting the health industry will accelerate changes that are disruptive to enable lower costs, better care and more direct engagement of consumers. The confluence of these trends challenges traditional approaches to physician supply and demand and encourages disruptors who bring new approaches unconstrained by convention. The mega-deals recently announced-- CVS-Aetna, Amazon-Berkshire Hathaway-JP Morgan, Apple AC Wellness Clinics, Cigna-Express Scripts and others-- are big bets that the way the future healthcare workforce operates and the roles physicians play is not simply a tweaking of our past. It’s a new day. Is there a shortage of physicians? Judging from wait times for new patients to get appointments, access to specialists in rural communities, and challenges facing individuals lacking insurance coverage, one might conclude yes.  But conventional ways physician supply-demand is calculated based on population changes, disease prevalence and physician retirement present an incomplete picture. It’s a myth that there’s a dramatic shortage of physicians unless one believes the future of health---the roles physicians play and the roles consumers play—is only a modest change from our past. The evidence from the marketplace is otherwise.

SOLVENCY

1. Not the best & brightest – no massive benefit to the U.S.

H-1B workers are average or below average, and no one's ever proven that they're better than Americans

Dr. Norman Matloff 2013 (PhD mathematics; professor of computer science at the University of California, Davis ) Are foreign students the ‘best and brightest’? 28 Feb 2013 <https://www.epi.org/publication/bp356-foreign-students-best-brightest-immigration-policy/>

Though the United States should indeed welcome the immigration of “the world’s best brains,” are the foreign students typically of that caliber? The tech industry has put forth little to support such assertions. It has pointed to some famous immigrant success stories in the field but, in most cases, the people cited, such as Google cofounder Sergey Brin, never held foreign-student (F-1) or work (H-1B) visas (Brin immigrated with his parents to the United States at age 6). And more importantly, neither the industry nor any other participant in this national debate has offered any empirical analysis documenting that the visa holders are of exceptionally high talent. This report aims to remedy this lack of data. With an eye toward the green card proposals, it will focus mainly on those who first entered the United States as foreign students in computer science or electrical engineering (CS/EE)—the two fields that make up the bulk of the H-1Bs.[1](https://www.epi.org/publication/bp356-foreign-students-best-brightest-immigration-policy/#_note1) It will also look at foreign tech workers in general. The study finds that the tech industry’s “genius” claims for these groups are not supported by the available data. Compared to Americans of the same education and age, the former foreign students turn out to be weaker than, or at most comparable to, the Americans in terms of salary, patent applications, Ph.D. dissertation awards, and quality of the doctoral program in which they studied.

DISADVANTAGES

1. American workers displaced

More and more companies use H-1B to fire US workers & replace them with immigrants

CBS News 2017 (journalist Bill Whitaker) Are U.S. jobs vulnerable to workers with H-1B visas? 19 Mar 2017 <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/are-u-s-jobs-vulnerable-to-workers-with-h-1b-visas/>

A frequent target of candidate Trump was the H-1B visa program. The program, created more than 25 years ago, allows American companies to fill gaps in the workforce from overseas with highly skilled employees, who can't be found in the U.S. Many businesses use the program as intended, but we discovered more and more are taking advantage of loopholes in the law to fire American workers and replace them with younger, cheaper, temporary foreign workers with H-1B visas. But before the American workers walk out the door they often face the humiliating prospect of having to train the people taking their jobs.

The top 10 H-1B hiring firms are outsourcing companies specifically designed to replace American workers

Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 22 Aug 2016 " Top 10 H-1B employers are all IT offshore outsourcing firms, costing U.S. workers tens of thousands of jobs" <https://www.epi.org/blog/top-10-h-1b-employers-are-all-it-offshore-outsourcing-firms-costing-u-s-workers-tens-of-thousands-jobs/> (ellipses in original)

The top 10 H-1B employers all use the program to send American jobs offshore. All of the firms are leaders in using the offshore outsourcing business model to sell information technology (IT) Services. Contrary to what some have claimed, not all of the top H-1B offshore outsourcing companies are Indian companies or headquartered in India: Five of the firms have their headquarters in India, four are headquartered in the United States, and one is headquartered in Ireland. But all of the top 10 have a common business model with large workforces in India and other low-cost countries. In 2014, the U.S. government granted these ten firms 25,227 new H-1B workers, nearly 30 percent of the 85,000 annual quota. And 2014 was not an unusual year. Over the ten-year span from 2005-14 those offshoring firms brought in a staggering 170,535 new H-1B guestworkers (see **Table 1**). Virtually all of these jobs can, and should, be done by American workers or lawful permanent residents (i.e., permanent immigrants already living in the United States). In fact, in many cases American workers were already doing the job, and they are being directly replaced, often being forced to train their foreign guestworker replacements as a condition of severance agreements. As Craig Diangelo, an American worker who was forced to train his H-1B replacement [put it](https://www.reuters.com/article/us-magazine-voter-oliphant-idUSKCN10D1WG), “The sad part is that my job is still there… It didn’t go away. I went away.”

Despite the wording of the law, the Dept of Labor says employers can legally cut wages and legally replace existing US workers with H-1Bs

Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 1 Mar 2016 Congressional Testimony The Impact of High-Skilled Immigration on U.S. Workers <https://www.epi.org/publication/congressional-testimony-the-impact-of-high-skilled-immigration-on-u-s-workers-4/> (brackets in original)

Many key facts of this case are very clear and I think there are some important conclusions to draw here. In its findings, the U.S. Department of Labor has affirmed the following are legal: 1. H-1B workers can legally be paid much less than American workers – in the case of Southern California Edison it was 40-50% less. 2. American workers can legally be replaced by an H-1B worker. The Labor Department has found these H-1B employment practices to be legal despite the following attestations all employers must make on the Labor Condition Application for an H-1B [US DOL: ETA FORM 9035]:  
(1) Wages: Pay nonimmigrants at least the local prevailing wage or the employer’s actual wage, whichever is higher, and pay for non-productive time. Offer nonimmigrants benefits on the same basis as offered to U.S. workers. (2) Working Conditions: Provide working conditions for nonimmigrants which will not adversely affect the working conditions of workers similarly employed

H-1B is all about shipping US jobs to India

Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 22 Aug 2016 " Top 10 H-1B employers are all IT offshore outsourcing firms, costing U.S. workers tens of thousands of jobs" <https://www.epi.org/blog/top-10-h-1b-employers-are-all-it-offshore-outsourcing-firms-costing-u-s-workers-tens-of-thousands-jobs/> (ellipses and brackets in original)

As then Indian Commerce Minister Kamal Nath [told the New York Times](https://www.nytimes.com/2007/04/12/business/worldbusiness/12iht-visa.4.5257621.html) in 2007:  
it [the H-1B] has become the outsourcing visa. … If at one point you had X amount of outsourcing and now you have a much higher quantum of outsourcing, you need that many more visas.  
The goal of the firms is to ship as much of the IT work and tasks as possible to offshore workers in low-cost countries like India, and the H-1B program plays the critical role in the transfer and maintenance of those contracts.

A/T "H-1B reduces outsourcing by bringing workers here" - Step by step process of how H-1B speeds up outsourcing of US jobs

Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 22 Aug 2016 " Top 10 H-1B employers are all IT offshore outsourcing firms, costing U.S. workers tens of thousands of jobs" <https://www.epi.org/blog/top-10-h-1b-employers-are-all-it-offshore-outsourcing-firms-costing-u-s-workers-tens-of-thousands-jobs/>

The H-1B worker acts as a liaison to the offshore team. Language and cultural commonalities help with the transfer of work to the offshore team, and the maintenance of that coordination. 3. The H-1B visa enables the foreign worker to come to the U.S. to learn the job. This is cheaper and easier than sending the U.S. worker to India to conduct the knowledge transfer. 4. Then the H-1B workers return to their country of origin, taking the knowledge and jobs and tasks with them. The upshot is that the government substantially lowers the costs of offshoring through the H-1B program. In essence, the government is heavily subsidizing offshoring through its lax H-1B policies.

A/T "They have to hire Americans first" - Loophole in the H-1B law says: No they don't, if the job pays more than $60K

CBS News in 2017 quoting journalist Bill Whitaker and former Congressman Bruce Morrison, who wrote the original H-1B law. Are U.S. jobs vulnerable to workers with H-1B visas? 19 Mar 2017 <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/are-u-s-jobs-vulnerable-to-workers-with-h-1b-visas/>

Bill Whitaker: Why can't we just say we're going to give jobs to Americans first?  
Bruce Morrison: Well, that's what the statute says, but --  
Bill Whitaker: But?  
Bruce Morrison: They put in a loophole. And the loophole says, "If ya pay over $60,000, ya can do that." And besides that, you don't have to try to find Americans. Well, $60,000 is not high pay for this kind of work. People doing this work today easily make $120,000-140,000.  
Bill Whitaker: Who put in that loophole?  
Bruce Morrison: Well, the-- it was done by Congress. But obviously the industry lobbied for it. It's really a travesty that should never have been allowed to happen.

2. American workers' pay reduced

1) H-1B employers use loopholes to pay less. 2) Simple supply & demand: When you bring in more workers, you drive down wages for everyone

Kellogg School of Management at Northwestern University 2016. " Does the H-1B Visa Program Hurt American Workers?" 7 Sept 2016 <https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/does-the-h1-b-visa-program-hurt-american-workers>

In theory, the visa program rules should prevent companies from paying H-1B workers less than their American counterparts. Employers are not allowed to offer an H-1B applicant a salary that is lower than similar employees’ pay or the “prevailing wage” for that job in that location. But the standards for determining prevailing wages are shaky, and companies can take advantage of loopholes, such as hiring the person through a third-party service. In addition, increasing the supply of workers might drive down everyone’s pay over time because employers have more potential employees to choose from and thus do not have to offer high salaries or raises to attract and retain staff.

Loopholes allow H-1B employers to pay lower wages

Harvard Business Review 2017 (Nicole Torres, assistant editor) 4 May 2017 The H-1B Visa Debate, Explained <https://hbr.org/2017/05/the-h-1b-visa-debate-explained>

Companies have to [attest](https://www.foreignlaborcert.doleta.gov/pdf/ETA_Form_9035CP.pdf) that they will not pay an H-1B worker less than they would an American, and that H-1B workers will not “adversely affect the working conditions” of other workers — but it’s often said that this hardly functions as a rule and is not strictly (if at all) enforced. There is also criticism that it opens up various loopholes that firms can exploit. For example, as a Kellogg Insight [research summary explains](https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/does-the-h1-b-visa-program-hurt-american-workers):  
The standards for determining prevailing wages are shaky, and companies can take advantage of loopholes, such as hiring the person through a third-party service. In addition, increasing the supply of workers might drive down everyone’s pay over time because employers have more potential employees to choose from and thus do not have to offer high salaries or raises to attract and retain staff.

3. Foreign workers exploited

H-1B exploits workers because they have no other options and can't complain about wages or work conditions

Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 22 Aug 2016 " Top 10 H-1B employers are all IT offshore outsourcing firms, costing U.S. workers tens of thousands of jobs" <https://www.epi.org/blog/top-10-h-1b-employers-are-all-it-offshore-outsourcing-firms-costing-u-s-workers-tens-of-thousands-jobs/>

Thanks to the legal and regulatory framework of the H-1B visa, H-1B workers can legally paid much less than similarly situated Americans. In fact, sometimes H-1B workers are [40 percent cheaper than Americans](https://www.epi.org/blog/new-data-infosys-tata-abuse-h-1b-program/), and as an additional bonus to employers, H-1B workers are unlikely to complain about substandard wages and working conditions since the work visa is controlled by the employer. That [makes H-1B workers vulnerable](https://www.revealnews.org/article-legacy/5-tricks-tech-staffing-firms-use-to-exploit-immigrant-workers/)—if they speak out they might be terminated—which means they’ll have to immediately depart from the United States or else become undocumented. The offshore outsourcing business model emerged in the early 2000s, completely disrupting the IT services sector. And the exploitation of H-1B guestworker program is at the core of the model.

H-1B's are indentured servants, and that's one of the attractive features why companies want them. They can't switch to another employer

Dr. Norman Matloff 2013 (PhD mathematics; professor of computer science at the University of California, Davis ) Are foreign students the ‘best and brightest’? 28 Feb 2013 <https://www.epi.org/publication/bp356-foreign-students-best-brightest-immigration-policy/>

If you are a Silicon Valley employer in the midst of an urgent project, you suffer a major loss if an engineer suddenly leaves for another employer. Hiring a foreign worker and sponsoring him for a green card remedies your predicament, as the worker becomes a de facto indentured servant (NRC 2001). Such exploitation is pitched by immigration attorneys to employers as the major attraction of green card sponsorship.

4. "Brain Drain" hurts poor countries sending immigrants to the US

Poor in India lose health care when their doctors immigrate to the US with H-1B

Nathalie Baptiste 2014 (journalist) " Brain Drain and the Politics of Immigration" 26 Feb 2014 THE NATION <https://www.thenation.com/article/brain-drain-and-politics-immigration/>

The increase of available H-1B visas allows for highly educated foreigners to pursue a more prosperous career in the United States. But what does it mean for the countries they leave behind? In India, home to the [large majority](http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2013-08-20/india-nabs-nearly-two-thirds-of-u-s-h-1b-visas.html) of H-1B visa recipients, many medical students opt to study abroad because of rising costs and limited capacity at their public institutions. The medical brain drain in India not only reduces the number of doctors available for care, but it also removes [the people needed](http://www.npr.org/templates/transcript/transcript.php?storyId=16783065) to push for healthcare reforms. Considered the [most privatized health system](http://www.dw.de/indias-health-services-in-urgent-need-of-treatment/a-15969421) in the world, India’s public health system is made up of mainly rural health centers that lack basic infrastructure, medicines and staff. India spends only 0.9 percent of its GDP on healthcare, which promotes a large private healthcare industry that [remains inaccessible](http://www.dw.de/indias-health-services-in-urgent-need-of-treatment/a-15969421) to the poor. The wealthy [can afford to be treated](http://www.dw.de/indias-health-services-in-urgent-need-of-treatment/a-15969421) at a state-of-the-art hospital for a stomach ache, while the poor must walk long miles to receive treatment for sicknesses and sometimes discover that the medicine they need is unavailable. The shortage of doctors is staggering: there are [only six doctors](http://www.dw.de/brain-drain-of-medical-students-in-india-higher-than-ever/a-17266607) for every 10,000 patients. People in need of medical attention may spend days waiting in line for tests or drugs because there are simply [not enough doctors](http://www.nytimes.com/2008/10/01/world/asia/01iht-medical.1.16607251.html?_r=0) and nurses available to tend to their medical needs.

Talented workers should be encouraged to stay home and build up their own countries instead of migrating to the U.S.

Nathalie Baptiste 2014 (journalist) " Brain Drain and the Politics of Immigration" 26 Feb 2014 THE NATION <https://www.thenation.com/article/brain-drain-and-politics-immigration/>

Ensuring that skilled workers have opportunities to flourish at home is ultimately a challenge for source countries, not the richer countries that absorb them when they leave. But the loss of brain power to the United States and other developed countries creates an unfortunate cycle for poorer countries: educated individuals migrate, leaving their home countries’ tax base and infrastructure in poor shape. The weakened infrastructure in turn means that more people will leave, driving the cycle onward. In order to solve this problem, the governments of developing nations should strive to create incentives for their educated workers to stay home and use their abilities to create a better and more sustainable society.

5. "Best & Brightest" Turn

Link & Impact: Actually they're NOT the best & brightest, and their lack of skills drags down the US economy

Prof. Norm Matloff 2017 (computer science, Univ of California-Davis) 3 Feb 2017 " Trump Is Right: Silicon Valley Is Using H-1B Visas To Pay Low Wages To Immigrants" HUFFINGTON POST <https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/trump-h-1b_us_5890d86ce4b0522c7d3d84af>

Aside from the reduced wages and reduced job opportunities H-1B and EB inflict on American workers, there is a broader impact that is far worse. We should of course support facilitating the immigration of “the best and the brightest.” But research performed at the [University of Michigan](http://www.nber.org/papers/w14792) and [Rutgers University](http://www.nber.org/papers/w14920), as well as [my own work](http://www.epi.org/publication/bp356-foreign-students-best-brightest-immigration-policy/) for the Economic Policy Institute, shows that the former foreign students now in the U.S. workforce tend to be weaker than their American peers. On a per capita basis, the former foreign students in computer science file fewer patents, are less likely to work in research and development and have degrees from less selective U.S. universities. Given the [indirect](http://www.colgate.edu/portaldata/imagegallerywww/0225a1d8-0850-4bb1-88f2-fc550662e306/ImageGallery/HighEdImmigIR.pdf) and [direct](https://www.nytimes.com/2016/01/26/us/lawsuit-claims-disney-colluded-to-replace-us-workers-with-immigrants.html)displacement of Americans by foreign workers, this amounts to replacing stronger people with weaker ones in science, technology, engineering and mathematics — the STEM fields. The harm this brings to our economy, our ability to innovate and our general national interest is immense.

Works Cited: H-1B Visas - con

1. WALL STREET JOURNAL 2016 (journalists Jon Hilsenrath and Bob Davis) America’s Dazzling Tech Boom Has a Downside: Not Enough Jobs https://www.wsj.com/articles/americas-dazzling-tech-boom-has-a-downside-not-enough-jobs-1476282355?mod=djemalertNEWS
2. CBS News 2017 (journalist Bill Whitaker) Are U.S. jobs vulnerable to workers with H-1B visas? 19 Mar 2017 https://www.cbsnews.com/news/are-u-s-jobs-vulnerable-to-workers-with-h-1b-visas/
3. Kellogg School of Management at Northwestern University 2016. " Does the H-1B Visa Program Hurt American Workers?" 7 Sept 2016 https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/does-the-h1-b-visa-program-hurt-american-workers
4. Nathalie Baptiste 2014 (journalist) " Brain Drain and the Politics of Immigration" 26 Feb 2014 THE NATION https://www.thenation.com/article/brain-drain-and-politics-immigration/
5. CBS News in 2017 quoting journalist Bill Whitaker and former Congressman Bruce Morrison, who wrote the original H-1B law. Are U.S. jobs vulnerable to workers with H-1B visas? 19 Mar 2017 https://www.cbsnews.com/news/are-u-s-jobs-vulnerable-to-workers-with-h-1b-visas/
6. Dr. Ron Hira 2016 (PhD public policy; associate professor of public policy at Howard University) 22 Aug 2016 " Top 10 H-1B employers are all IT offshore outsourcing firms, costing U.S. workers tens of thousands of jobs" https://www.epi.org/blog/top-10-h-1b-employers-are-all-it-offshore-outsourcing-firms-costing-u-s-workers-tens-of-thousands-jobs/
7. Dr. Norman Matloff 2013 (PhD mathematics; professor of computer science at the University of California, Davis ) Are foreign students the ‘best and brightest’? 28 Feb 2013 https://www.epi.org/publication/bp356-foreign-students-best-brightest-immigration-policy/